

# **ADMIN Tim**

April 30, 2016 - 3:00 am

Well, welcome this evening/morning to Stephanie Mann, author of Supremacy and Survival. Thanks so much for coming to this live chat event and I declare the session ... OFFICIALLY OPEN!



### **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:01 am

My husband and I enjoyed two wonderful trips to Montreal!



# **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:01 am

Thank you, Tim!



#### ADMIN Tim

April 30, 2016 - 3:01 am

Can I start with a question posed by Beth von Staats ... I am curious whether there is any symbolism at all to the fact that Saint Thomas More and Saint John Cardinal Fisher were canonized on May 19, 1935, the anniversary of the execution of Queen Anne Boleyn. Stephanie discusses the symbolism of the date of beautification (the feast day of Saint Thomas Becket). Also the feast day for More and Fisher is the anniversary of the execution of Fisher, June 22, but with 365 days in a year, choosing May 19th seems hardly coincidental. Any thoughts on this?



#### Laurie

April 30, 2016 - 3:01 am

Great, yes it is a beautiful city! It is great to "meet" you!



### **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:02 am

I suggested to Beth that the pope was more focused on current events--the rise of fascism.



## **Roland Hui**

April 30, 2016 - 3:02 am

Laurie: I'm from Montreal too.



# **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:03 am

So the date of the actual canonizations was not selected with any intent against Anne Boleyn.



#### **Lorna Wanstall**

April 30, 2016 - 3:04 am

When Thomas more was chopped up, what happened to the rest of his family?



## **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:05 am

His widow had to fight for her pension and had some rough times financially.



### **Lorna Wanstall**

April 30, 2016 - 3:05 am

We know about Margaret or part of her story



#### **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:06 am

Other family members were implicated in later plots--John More, the youngest and only son, took the oath his father would not!



### **Roland Hui**

April 30, 2016 - 3:06 am

Stephanie - What are your thoughts about 'A Man For All Seasons' (the 1966 film)?



#### **Lorna Wanstall**

April 30, 2016 - 3:06 am

I often wonder if More thought about the consequences of his death would have on his family.



#### **Lorna Wanstall**

April 30, 2016 - 3:06 am

I often wonder if More thought about the consequences of his death would have on his family.



### **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:07 am

It's a beautifully made film, Roland--the music, the acting, costumes, etc, are tremendous!



## **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:08 am

Yes, Lorna, he did. He prepared a trust to try to protect some assets for his soon-to-be widow's care and for the rest of the family.



# Lorna Wanstall

April 30, 2016 - 3:08 am

Did More's widow manage to get any money out of I suppose it would have been cromwell in the end



#### **Doc Clark**

April 30, 2016 - 3:09 am

It is a beautiful film but in a way it is not completely faithful to Bolt's play in that it dropped the character and plot device of "everyman" who is the foil for More's actions.



#### **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:09 am

She had some lands from her previous marriage but she also had to contend with her step son-in-law, William Roper!



## **Roland Hui**

April 30, 2016 - 3:09 am

Yes, it was interesting that Vanessa Redgrave was in both the film and tv versions. Did you like the tv version as much?



#### **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:09 am

I agree, Doc--I just saw the stage play a couple of months ago.



#### **ADMIN Tim**

April 30, 2016 - 3:10 am

Following on from Roland's question, Claire (who is happily tucked up in bed at the moment and sends her sleepy apologies) wanted to know if you watched/read Wolf Hall, and what you thought of the portrayal in that telling of history?



#### **Doc Clark**

April 30, 2016 - 3:10 am

The TV movie was Bolt's play. I liked it. I especially liked Redgrave in it. I had to laugh at the Henry VIII. Way tooo short!



### **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:11 am

I think I watched it, Roland, but I don't remember it well--Charlton Heston is a great historical period actor, though!



# **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:11 am

I have not read the book but I did watch the series. As I commented in my talk, I think the caricature of More goes too far.



#### **Doc Clark**

April 30, 2016 - 3:12 am

I really liked your expert talk on More. I was quite struck by the quite relevant point that Catholic saintdom can two different bases, living witness and witness thru death (id est "martyrdom"). I had just watched some BBC documentary (forget which one) which had Hilary Mantel as one of the people interviewed. Her take on More is very negative - dissed him for living a dreadful life. And it struck me that it wasn't his life he was sainted for. I'm not really familiar with the criteria upon which he was canonized, but it was his martyrdom, not his life that was the basis, yes? Mantel



### **Lorna Wanstall**

April 30, 2016 - 3:12 am

I agree Stephanie he is. his potrayal of Moses and Ben hur was brilliant



#### **Carol Clifford**

April 30, 2016 - 3:12 am

I can't help thinking that such a highly principled man as Thomas More would have expected his family to support him - regardless of the consequences for them after his death.



#### **Doc Clark**

April 30, 2016 - 3:13 am

I don't think Mantel has an appreciation for how the Catholic Church evaluates saintdom.



# **Lorna Wanstall**

April 30, 2016 - 3:13 am

I have never really understood more reasoning for not taking the oath.



# Stephanie Mann

April 30, 2016 - 3:13 am

Carol, he hoped for their support--John Guy's biography of Margaret shows how much he relied on her, especially when Alice would not support him.



#### **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:15 am

Lorna, he and Bishop John Fisher did not believe that the Parliament of England, or its King, could say who the head of the Church was.



## **Doc Clark**

April 30, 2016 - 3:16 am

Please correct me if I'm wrong Steph. The reason More did not take the oath is because it removed the Pope as the head of Christ's church on Earth.



#### Stephanie Mann

April 30, 2016 - 3:16 am

Doc, it is important to understand how the Catholic Church slowly and carefully investigates claims of holiness for either martyrs or confessors.



#### **ADMIN Tim**

April 30, 2016 - 3:16 am

Can you explain more Steph?



# **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:17 am

Well at least in England, Doc! I thought Richard Rex's article in the last issue about how Henry VIII was neither fully Catholic nor completely Protestant was very helpful.



#### **Roland Hui**

April 30, 2016 - 3:17 am

Eric Ives in his book 'Anne Boleyn' drew attention to the interesting, but not widely known fact, that More was willing to accept Anne Boleyn as Queen. But for England to reject the Pope, was totally a different matter to More.



## **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:18 am

Roland, that's a good point. More was willing to accept any heirs from Anne too!



# **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:19 am

Explain more about saints, Tim?



# **ADMIN Tim**

April 30, 2016 - 3:19 am

Yes, if you would! I'm from a very protestant background.



#### **Roland Hui**

April 30, 2016 - 3:20 am

I wonder if poor Queen Katherine, who was friendly with More, ever knew More was willing to accept Anne as her replacement.



### **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:20 am

Causes for saints begin at the diocesan, local level. Then the facts about the proposed saint are gathered and presented to Rome.



#### **Lorna Wanstall**

April 30, 2016 - 3:22 am

I rather think that Henry chopped and changed his religious stance on a day to day basis. I.e he was Catholic one day and protestant the next or even hourly. Nobody really knew what he was up too, and to be honest I don't think he knew himself half the time



#### **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:22 am

The promoters of the cause try to spread devotion to their candidate and ask people to pray for the saint to intercede for them for some kind of miracle--at least that's the process for a confessor, who did not die as a martyr.



#### **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:23 am

For a martyr, the circumstances of the execution or martyrdom have to be investigated and there has to be indications of devotion to the martyr.



# **Carol Clifford**

April 30, 2016 - 3:23 am

I've read the two books by Hilary Mantel and liked them because of their different approach to Anne Bolyn, Thomas Moore and Cromwell. That said, it is hard to believe these three were really like their

depiction in the books. I think she got Henry III correct though and with him as the villain in a work of fiction, perhaps it was necessary to humanise Cromwell as well as tinker with the personalities of Moore and Anne... as facts can often be distorted in fiction.



## **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:23 am

Does that help, Tim?



#### **Doc Clark**

April 30, 2016 - 3:23 am

When did the investigation apparatus that's currently in place (formal investigation, verification of miracles, etc.) become the standard practice? Was it in place as far back as Henry VIII's reign?



## **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:24 am

It has developed over time, Doc. By Henry VIII's time, that would have been the general process.



# ADMIN Tim

April 30, 2016 - 3:24 am

Yes, it helps. Thanks.



#### ADMIN Tim

April 30, 2016 - 3:25 am

Another question from Claire ... What would you say to people who suggest he shouldn't be a saint because he ordered the death of reformers? (and I'm assuming it's not supposed to be an attacking question, more of her wanting to know your opinion on this!)



# **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:25 am

Now of course, causes of saints have the internet and social media to help spread the word!



#### ADMIN Tim

April 30, 2016 - 3:25 am

The more Facebook likes you get, the more likely you are to be a saint ... I like it <(



#### **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:26 am

I don't know about what Katherine of Aragon knew about More's position, Roland--she certainly knew that John Fisher was a great defender of the validity of her marriage to Henry VIII!



# Lorna Wanstall

April 30, 2016 - 3:26 am

I believe that St Stephen is the first accepted Christian Martyr, Not to sure on that one



### **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:27 am

Re: the death of reformers. I think we have to start with the position that in England, according to the Laws at the time of More's Chancellorship, they were not reformers, but heretics.



#### **ADMIN Tim**

April 30, 2016 - 3:28 am

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Chronological\_list\_of\_saints\_in\_the\_1st\_century - lists Joachim, the father of the Virgin Mary as the first saint ... though of course we can't always trust Wiki



# **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:28 am

And that the State, the Monarch, had an interest in suppressing heresy, as it had done in the previou

centuries, esp. during the Lollard period.



#### **Roland Hui**

April 30, 2016 - 3:28 am

After More's death, how did his son John do in life?



# **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:29 am

More was investigating heretics on behalf of the King and fulfilling his vow as chancellor.



#### **Lorna Wanstall**

April 30, 2016 - 3:30 am

Is there any truth in the story that Margaret rescued Thomas's head from being thrown in the river, and that she kept it until she died.



#### **Roland Hui**

April 30, 2016 - 3:30 am

Are there known descendent of More today?



## **ADMIN Tim**

April 30, 2016 - 3:30 am

So he was doing his job and therefore this doesn't impact on his validity for sainthood. Ok.



### **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:30 am

Roland, I've read more about Margaret than John, so I'm not sure! (I'm preparing a presentation on Margaret for a local group here in Wichita)



## **ADMIN Tim**

April 30, 2016 - 3:31 am

(can we have an audio recording of your presentation? cheeky ask...)



#### **Roland Hui**

April 30, 2016 - 3:31 am

'descendants' I mean.



#### **Carol Clifford**

April 30, 2016 - 3:31 am

I've never thought Thomas Moore should have been sainted - precisely because he ordered the deaths of the reformers... or heretics... and can't help thinking a saint should be a Godly and loving person and not prone to causing people to die...



## **Doc Clark**

April 30, 2016 - 3:31 am

Roland, she removed it from the gate on London Bridge. That's fact. What she did afterwards with it, I don't recall.



#### Stephanie Mann

April 30, 2016 - 3:31 am

Lorna, I believe that is true. His head is in the Roper tomb in St. Dunstan's (an Anglican church) in Canterbury.



# **Lorna Wanstall**

April 30, 2016 - 3:31 am

Ah so not far from me hten



## Stephanie Mann

April 30, 2016 - 3:32 am

I think they'll record it, Tim; I'll ask!



### **Lorna Wanstall**

April 30, 2016 - 3:32 am

then



#### ADMIN Tim

April 30, 2016 - 3:32 am

(only if it isn't too much of an imposition. Thanks!)



# ADMIN Tim

April 30, 2016 - 3:34 am

Keep your questions coming in, we have just under 30 mins to learn all we can about More from Stephanie.



## **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:34 am

I understand, Carol.



#### ADMIN Tim

April 30, 2016 - 3:35 am

As well as preparing for your talk, are you writing another book at the moment?



# **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:36 am

No, although I have one drafted about the Catholic martyrs from Henry VIII's time to Charles II's!



#### Lorna Wanstall

April 30, 2016 - 3:37 am

What is known about More before he came into favour with H8.



#### **Roland Hui**

April 30, 2016 - 3:38 am

Stephanie - what other Tudor personalities (besides More) do you find interesting?



#### **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:38 am

He studied at Oxford and then, because of his father's encouragement, read Law to become a lawyer.



### **Lorna Wanstall**

April 30, 2016 - 3:39 am

But did he not also consider becomming a monk



### **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:39 am

Lorna, he also discerned whether or not he had a religious vocation and then decided he did not, and married Jane Colt.



#### **Lorna Wanstall**

April 30, 2016 - 3:39 am

or a layman



#### **Doc Clark**

April 30, 2016 - 3:39 am

More wrote 6 works after he stepped down from being chancellor. I confess I've only read one of them... His books and writing materials were taken from him towards the end of his stay in tghe Tower. How did

the works he wrote there get out and survive?



#### **Roland Hui**

April 30, 2016 - 3:40 am

Did More help bring Hans Holbein to H8's attention?



### **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:40 am

Doc, his daughter Margaret visited him often in the Tower and then they continued to correspond. he gave her those works to preserve and publish



### **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:41 am

I'm not sure about that, Roland.



### **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:42 am

Other Tudor figures? Katherine of Aragon is fascinating to me. Margaret Pole, the Countess of Salisbury, also.



#### Lorna Wanstall

April 30, 2016 - 3:42 am

I think that Hans Holbien did a picture of H7, and after H7 died H8 just decided to keep him on



# **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:43 am

Thanks, Lorna! Holbein also continued working for the More family after Thomas' execution--William commissioned small portraits of Margaret and himself.



# **ADMIN Tim**

April 30, 2016 - 3:43 am

I was going to mention the pictures:https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Sir Thomas More and Family



# **ADMIN Tim**

April 30, 2016 - 3:44 am

I love this picture so much as it has so many details in it about the dress, their personalities and so on.



## **Doc Clark**

April 30, 2016 - 3:44 am

The nature of Utopia and his later religious writings are very different from his response to Luther's work against Henry VIII and his unpublished bio of Richard III. I find them almost like comparing Aquinas vs. the National Inquirer... I have never been able to reconcile the two poles of his written works. Do you have any thoughts on that?



## **Carol Clifford**

April 30, 2016 - 3:45 am

Ultimately, More was yet another victim of a mad Henry VIII... that must have changed how he thought about lots of things...



#### **Lorna Wanstall**

April 30, 2016 - 3:45 am

I agree Stephanie that KoA is rather dazzling. despite all the stuff h8 put her though she loved him right to the bitter end. Her last letter is really heartbreaking



### **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:46 am

Doc, authors wrote differently in the 16th century than we do today. We have rules about what a biography is supposed to be, how history is to be written.



### **Lorna Wanstall**

April 30, 2016 - 3:46 am

Carol the word "mad" to describe henry is very mild.



#### Lorna Wanstall

April 30, 2016 - 3:47 am

I call him a lot of names



### **Carol Clifford**

April 30, 2016 - 3:47 am

I was being polite Lorna...



#### **Lorna Wanstall**

April 30, 2016 - 3:48 am

I take it you don't like him much either



## **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:48 am

For example, when More wrote about Richard III he wasn't writing a biography or history; he was exploring the idea of tyranny -- which is probably why he did not finish it!



#### Laurie

April 30, 2016 - 3:48 am

Stephanie, do you think that a part of Henry VIII regretted More's execution? Since he really had been a significant part of his life up until then..



### **Doc Clark**

April 30, 2016 - 3:48 am

That's a good point - I hadn't thought of it that way. It's easy to forget they thought differently back then about a lot of stuff.



# **Carol Clifford**

April 30, 2016 - 3:49 am

I am impressed with how Thomas More stayed sane during his imprisonment...



#### **Lorna Wanstall**

April 30, 2016 - 3:49 am

Is that why it's believed that Richard killed the boys in the tower.



#### **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:49 am

I don't know, Laurie. He certainly expressed his regret for beheading Cromwell!



## **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:50 am

Carol, he prayed and prayed. And his daughter Margaret helped him too, as John Guy describes in his great book, A Daughter's Love.



# **Carol Clifford**

April 30, 2016 - 3:51 am

I'll have to read it... it something I've always wondered about...



# **ADMIN Tim**

April 30, 2016 - 3:51 am

We love John Guy. Such a great writer and a really nice person too.



# **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:51 am

Lorna, I believe that is correct.



# **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:51 am

Tim, I am looking forward to his new study of the last years of Elizabeth I!



#### **Lorna Wanstall**

April 30, 2016 - 3:51 am

I think the level of the regret that Henry felt for Cromwell was because he now had to sort out the rubbish that was being thrown at him day in day out and before Cromwell did it all!



#### **Doc Clark**

April 30, 2016 - 3:52 am

A Daughter's Love by John Guy...another book added to the "must read" pile... \*\*\*sigh\*\*\*



# **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:52 am

That's true, Lorna!



# ADMIN Tim

April 30, 2016 - 3:52 am

We want to get him here on Tudor Society, but he's always so busy. Anyway... back to Steph!



#### **Doc Clark**

April 30, 2016 - 3:53 am

If you were to recommend one "must read" book on Thomas More, what would it be, Steph?



# **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:54 am

The Cambridge Companion to Thomas More.



#### **Stephanie Mann**

April 30. 2016 - 3:55 am

It's all there: biography, analysis of his career, examination of his controversial works, etc.



### **Lorna Wanstall**

April 30, 2016 - 3:55 am

Is there any truth in the story that Thomas pinpointed the exact location to where the boys were buried..



## **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:57 am

I'm not sure about that, either, Lorna! That's a great English mystery I haven't studied that much!



#### **Doc Clark**

April 30, 2016 - 3:58 am

What More wrote was that they were buried at the bottom of a stair (location unspecified) and were later dug back up by a priest to be buried elsewhere (location unspecified).



# **ADMIN Tim**

April 30, 2016 - 3:58 am

Ladies and gentlemen, our time is nearly up. I've just done a random draw on those who are on the talk tonight and Roland ... you're tonight's winner of a copy of Supremacy and Survival by Stephanie.

# Congratulations



# **Roland Hui**

April 30, 2016 - 3:58 am

Wow - thanks!



# **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:58 am

I hope you enjoy it, Roland!



## **Doc Clark**

April 30, 2016 - 3:58 am

Thank you Steph!



## Lorna Wanstall

April 30, 2016 - 3:58 am

Nice one Roland, Happy Reading Xxx



### Laurie

April 30, 2016 - 3:59 am

Yes, thanks so much!



# **Roland Hui**

April 30, 2016 - 3:59 am

Thanks Stephanie, and great talk tonight!



# **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 3:59 am

Thank you all for your questions and comments.



## **Lorna Wanstall**

April 30, 2016 - 3:59 am

The boys murder/disppearence has been talked about in our forum from time to time. we have some very interesting ideas too



### **ADMIN Tim**

April 30, 2016 - 4:00 am

By all means do keep chatting - the chat room is always open. I'm looking forward to getting to bed (again), so I'll sign off. Thank you so much for your time and your talk Stephanie! It's really appreciated by our members.



#### **Stephanie Mann**

April 30, 2016 - 4:00 am

I've enjoyed it so much.